# Accounting for Trade Deficits<sup>\*</sup>

Hakan Yilmazkuday<sup>†</sup>

March 9, 2021

#### Abstract

This paper proposes a decomposition for the total trade deficit of a country by using implications of a dynamic trade model. It is shown that the total trade deficit of a country can be decomposed into changes due to its effective terms of trade, its relative trade costs, and its macroeconomic developments with respect to its export partners. The implications for *bilateral* trade are estimated using both imports and exports data for 188 countries, and the decomposition of *total* trade deficit is achieved for each country. Empirical results show evidence for heterogeneity across countries regarding the decomposition of trade deficits, suggesting alternative policy tools to rebalance trade at the country level. A cross-country investigation further suggests that relative trade costs, followed by relative macroeconomic developments, have contributed the most to the heterogeneity of trade imbalances.

JEL Classification: F13, F14

Key Words: Trade Deficit; Decomposition; Terms of Trade; Trade Costs

<sup>\*</sup>The author would like to thank Menzie Chinn and two anonymous referees as well as Emine Boz, Walter Steingress, and Midwest International Economics Meetings participants at Vanderbilt University for very helpful comments and suggestions. The usual disclaimer applies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>Department of Economics, Florida International University, Miami, FL 33199, USA; hyilmazk@fiu.edu.

#### 1 Introduction

Trade deficits (defined as the difference between total imports and total exports) have been experienced by more than 70% of the countries around the globe between 1979-2015.<sup>1</sup> Having a trade deficit is problematic, because it is simply financed by capital flows (from trade-surplus countries) of which sudden stop can be destabilizing not only at the country level but also globally (see Milesi-Ferretti and Razin (2000), Blanchard and Milesi-Ferretti (2009), Catão and Milesi-Ferretti (2014) or Caballero (2016)); moreover, a trade deficit can result in a dynamic Dutch disease (see Caballero and Lorenzoni (2014)). On the other hand, having a trade surplus is also problematic, because a trade surplus may reflect an underlying domestic distortion (see Blanchard and Milesi-Ferretti (2012)) or trade-surplus countries may become targets for protectionist measures by trading partners (see Carney (2017) or Obstfeld (2018)). Accordingly, having a balanced trade (or at least not having an excessive deficit/surplus) as investigated by Dekle, Eaton, and Kortum (2007) is desirable for any open economy, which requires the knowledge of the sources of trade deficit.

This paper investigates the sources of trade deficit by using an international trade approach. In particular, based on the implications of a dynamic trade model that incorporates implicitly additively separable nonhomothetic constant elasticity of substitution (CES) preferences as in studies such as by Hanoch (1975) or Comin, Lashkari, and Mestieri (2015), the trade deficit of any country is decomposed into the effects due to changes in effective terms of trade, relative trade costs, and relative macroeconomic developments. This is achieved in two steps. First, by using the implications of the dynamic trade model, bilateral imports and bilateral exports of 188 countries are estimated. As is standard in the international trade literature, these estimations result in fitted values representing bilateral trade costs, sourcetime fixed effects and destination-time fixed effects for both bilateral imports and bilateral exports in logs. Second, since the sum of logs is not equal to the log of sums due to Jensen's inequality (i.e., one cannot take the sum of log bilateral trade deficits to obtain log total trade deficit), the fitted values obtained from these estimations are connected to the changes in total trade deficit of each country over time by using the Taylor series of bilateral trade expressions. This innovation results in a decomposition of the level changes in total trade deficit of a country into changes in its effective terms of trade (representing the difference between the weighted average of import prices and the weighted average of export prices), changes in relative trade costs of the country (representing the changes in the weighted av-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>This corresponds to 137 out of 188 countries in the sample that is described in the data section. Trade deficit is defined as having a positive average trade deficit during the sample period.

erage of import trade costs and the weighted average of export trade costs), and relative macroeconomic developments of the country (representing changes in both relative economic activity and relative saving decisions with respect to its export partners). Since cumulative *changes over time* in the level of total trade deficit of any country is equal to its *level* of total trade deficit for any given period, a final decomposition can be achieved for the level of total trade deficit for any country.

The empirical results suggest that each country has different patterns over time regarding the contribution of each component in the decomposition of trade deficits, although relative trade costs followed by relative macroeconomic developments have contributed the most to the magnitude (of the trade deficit) during the sample period, on average across countries. When countries are categorized as Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) versus non-OECD countries, the average OECD country has experienced a trade surplus that is mostly explained by effective terms of trade followed by relative macroeconomic developments, whereas the average non-OECD country has experienced a trade deficit that is mostly explained by relative trade costs followed by relative macroeconomic developments. When subsamples are considered, it is shown that the establishment of the World Trade Organization (WTO) coincides with higher trade deficits for non-OECD countries that are accounted for by relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments, although trade surplus of OECD countries and its components have been stable over time.

Regarding country-specific results, for example, the U.S. trade deficit is mostly explained by the positive contributions of relative trade costs followed by those of effective terms of trade. In contrast, the negative Chinese trade deficit (i.e., its trade surplus) is mostly explained by its negative effective terms of trade, despite high and positive contributions of its relative macroeconomic developments. Another interesting country is Japan of which negative trade deficit (i.e., its trade surplus) is mostly explained by its relatively negative macroeconomic developments, followed by its negative relative trade costs.

Since trade imbalance of a country is financed through changes in its net foreign asset position, the international macro literature has investigated the reasons behind current account imbalances from a macroeconomic perspective (e.g., see Gourinchas and Rey (2014) for an excellent survey of the literature). This literature has mostly focused on consumption/saving and investment decisions of economic agents (i.e., intertemporal approach) as in Obstfeld and Rogoff (1995), asymmetries between financial and economic development in advanced and emerging countries as in Caballero, Farhi, and Gourinchas (2008), cross-country differences in the ability to insure away idiosyncratic risk as in Mendoza, Quadrini, and Rios-Rull (2009) or Angeletos and Panousi (2011), interactions between financial frictions and international trade as in Antras and Caballero (2009), and the market value of claims and liabilities underlying a country's net foreign position as in Lane and Milesi-Ferretti (2001).

This paper contributes to this literature by focusing on how trade-based variables such as source prices or international trade costs interact with macroeconomic developments to explain trade imbalances in a dynamic trade model. Although this trade-based approach is similar to studies such as by Dekle, Eaton, and Kortum (2007), Reyes-Heroles (2016) or Alessandria and Choi (2018), different from them, this paper contributes by providing an estimation-based decomposition that is essential to understand the sources of total trade imbalances for 188 countries. On top of these studies, a cross-country investigation in this paper has further shown that the heterogeneity across countries regarding their total trade deficits is mostly connected to their relative trade costs, followed by relative macroeconomic developments.<sup>2</sup> When the same investigation is achieved for OECD versus non-OECD countries, the heterogeneity across the latter can be attributed more relative trade costs, while this attribution is less for the former.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows. The next section introduces a dynamic trade model that is connected to the decomposition of trade deficits. Section 3 discusses the estimation methodology and the data used. Section 4 depicts the country-specific results. Section 5 depicts summary of results for country groups and achieves a cross-country investigation. Section 6 concludes. Derivations are achieved in the Appendix, whereas country-specific results are given in the Online Appendix.

### 2 Economic Environment

We would like to obtain an expression for the level of total trade deficits by introducing a dynamic trade model, where consumers in each country maximize their utility based on their consumption given as follows:

$$U_{nt} = E_0 \sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \beta^t \frac{(C_{nt})^{1-\sigma}}{1-\sigma}$$
(1)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>By focusing on bilateral trade balances (rather than total trade balances as in this paper), Felbermayr and Yotov (2019) have shown by using a trade approach that *bilateral* trade balances across countries can mostly be attributed to country-specific variables (corresponding to macroeconomic developments at the bilateral level in this paper).

where, for country n at time t,  $U_{nt}$  is the utility of consumers,  $E_0$  is the expectation operator,  $\beta$  is the discount factor, and  $C_{nt}$  is an overall consumption index. Utility is maximized with respect to the following budget constraint:

$$\underbrace{P_{nt}C_{nt}}_{\text{Expenditure}} + \underbrace{E_t \left\{ Q_{t+1,t}B_{nt+1} \right\} - B_{nt}}_{\text{Net Saving}} = \underbrace{P_{nnt}Y_{nt}}_{\text{Income}}$$
(2)

where  $P_{nt}$  is the price of  $C_{nt}$ ,  $Q_{t+1,t}$  is the stochastic discount factor for one-period ahead nominal pay-offs that is common across countries under the assumption of complete securities markets,  $B_{nt+1}$  is the nominal pay-off in period t + 1 of an international portfolio held at the end of period t,  $P_{nnt}$  is the price of home products, and  $Y_{nt}$  is the endowment of home products.<sup>3</sup> Utility maximization in country n results in the following stochastic Euler equation:

$$\beta R_t E_t \left\{ \left( \frac{C_{nt+1}}{C_{nt}} \right)^{-\sigma} \frac{P_{nt}}{P_{nt+1}} \right\} = 1$$
(3)

where  $R_t = \frac{1}{E_t\{Q_{t+1,t}\}}$  is the gross return (interest rate) on a riskless one-period discount bond paying off one unit of domestic currency in t + 1 that is common across countries due to complete securities markets.

Following the functional form in studies such as by Hanoch (1975) or Comin, Lashkari, and Mestieri (2015), the consumption index of  $C_{nt}$  is further given by implicitly additively separable nonhomothetic constant elasticity of substitution (CES) preferences:

$$C_{nt} = \underbrace{\left(C_{nt}\right)^{\frac{\varphi_n^H}{\theta}} \left(C_{nnt}\right)^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}} \left(1-\alpha\right)^{\frac{1}{\theta}}}_{\text{Due to Consumption of Home Products}} + \underbrace{\left(C_{nt}\right)^{\frac{\varphi_n^F}{\theta}} \sum_{i \neq n} \left(C_{nit}\right)^{\frac{\theta-1}{\theta}} \left(\alpha\right)^{\frac{1}{\theta}}}_{i \neq n} \tag{4}$$

Due to Consumption of Foreign Products

where, for country n at time t,  $C_{nit}$  represents products imported from country i (representing consumption of home products when i = n),  $\varphi_n^H$  governs income elasticity of demand for home products,  $\varphi_n^F$  governs income elasticity of demand for foreign products,  $\theta$  is the elasticity of substitution across products of different countries, and  $\alpha$  is (inversely) related to the degree of home bias in preferences as in studies such as by Gali and Monacelli (2005). The optimization across products of source countries results in the following demand function in country n for

 $<sup>^{3}</sup>$ It is important to emphasize that the rest of the investigation is not affected by the assumption of an endowment economy. In particular, when the endowment economy is replaced with an economy having a production side, it can be shown that one can obtain the very same decomposition given in Equation 9, where production-side details would be captured by macroeconomic developments.

products imported from country i at time t:

$$C_{nit} = \alpha \left(\frac{P_{nit}}{P_{nt}}\right)^{-\theta} (C_{nt})^{\varphi_n^F}$$
(5)

and the following demand function for home products:

$$C_{nnt} = (1 - \alpha) \left(\frac{P_{nnt}}{P_{nt}}\right)^{-\theta} (C_{nt})^{\varphi_n^H}$$
(6)

where  $P_{nit}$  and  $P_{nnt}$  are prices of  $C_{nit}$  and  $C_{nnt}$  satisfying:

$$P_{nt} = \left( (C_{nt})^{\varphi_n^H - 1} (P_{nnt})^{1-\theta} (1-\alpha) + (C_{nt})^{\varphi_n^F - 1} \sum_{i \neq n} (P_{nit})^{1-\theta} \alpha \right)^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}}$$
(7)

In a special case in which  $\varphi_n^H = \varphi_n^F = 1$ , the last three equations reduce to expressions that are implied by conventional CES preferences with unitary income elasticity. However, when  $\varphi_n^H \neq \varphi_n^F \neq 1$ , consumers distinguish between their demand for home versus foreign products following a change in their overall consumption  $C_{nt}$  (i.e., elasticity of foreign-goods consumption imported from country *i* with respect to  $C_{nt}$  is  $\frac{\partial C_{nit}}{\partial C_{nt}} \frac{C_{nt}}{C_{nit}} = \varphi_n^F$ , while elasticity of home-goods consumption with respect to  $C_{nt}$  is  $\frac{\partial C_{ntt}}{\partial C_{nt}} \frac{C_{nt}}{C_{nnt}} = \varphi_n^F$ ).<sup>4</sup>

#### 2.1 Implications for Bilateral Trade

In terms of log expenditures, Equation 5 representing imports of country n from country i can be rewritten as follows:

$$\log\left(P_{nit}C_{nit}\right) = (1-\theta)\log P_{iit} + (1-\theta)\log\tau_{nit} + \log Z_{nt} + \log\alpha \tag{8}$$

where iceberg trade costs  $\tau_{nit} > 1$  satisfying  $P_{nit} = \tau_{nit}P_{iit}$  have been used, with  $P_{iit}$  representing source prices, and  $Z_{nt} = (P_{nt})^{\theta} (C_{nt})^{\varphi_n^F}$  is a measure of economic activity (that would reduce to the value of nominal consumption in a special case of unitary elasticities,  $\theta = \varphi_n^F = 1$ ). In terms of future percentage changes, this expression can be rewritten as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Although  $\varphi_n^H$  and  $\varphi_n^F$  can take values different from 1, it is implied by Engel aggregation that their weighted average is equal to 1, where weights are home and foreign expenditure shares, respectively.

follows:

$$\underbrace{\Delta \log \left( P_{nit+1} C_{nit+1} \right)}_{\text{Trade Data}} = \underbrace{\left( 1 - \theta \right) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{iit+1} \right\}}_{\text{Source Prices}} + \underbrace{\left( 1 - \theta \right) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\}}_{\text{Bilateral Trade Costs}} \tag{9}$$

+ 
$$\underbrace{E_t \{\Delta \log (Z_{nt+1})\}}_{\text{Macroeconomic Developments}}$$
 +  $\underbrace{v_{nit+1,t}}_{\text{Residuals}}$ 

where  $\Delta$  represents time difference, and  $v_{nit+1,t} = \Delta \log (P_{nit+1}C_{nit+1}) - E_t \{\Delta \log (P_{nit+1}C_{nit+1})\}$ is the full-information rational expectations error and is thus uncorrelated with any information dated t or earlier.<sup>5</sup> Using Equation 3, macroeconomic developments represented by  $E_t \{\Delta \log (Z_{nt+1})\}$  in this expression can alternatively be written as follows:

$$\underbrace{E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \left( Z_{nt+1} \right) \right\}}_{\text{Macroeconomic Developments}} = \underbrace{\theta \log \left( \beta R_t \right)}_{\text{Saving Decision}} + \underbrace{\left( \varphi_n^F - \sigma \theta \right) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \left( C_{nt+1} \right) \right\}}_{\text{Changes in Real Consumption}}$$
(10)

where they depend on the saving decision of individuals as in studies such as by Obstfeld and Rogoff (1995) together with future expected changes in real consumption (that would effectively be eliminated in a special case of unitary elasticities,  $\theta = \varphi_n^F = \sigma = 1$ ).<sup>6</sup>

In terms of the literature, Equation 9 is in line with Allen, Arkolakis, and Takahashi (2018) who have shown that several international trade models such as by Anderson (1979), Anderson and Van Wincoop (2003), Eaton and Kortum (2002), Dekle, Eaton, and Kortum (2008), Caliendo and Parro (2015), Krugman (1980), Melitz (2003), Arkolakis, Demidova, Klenow, and Rodriguez-Clare (2008), di Giovanni and Levchenko (2009), and Bernard, Eaton, Jensen, and Kortum (2003) imply the very same *universal* gravity equation, where bilateral trade between any two countries depend on source prices, bilateral trade iceberg costs, and a measure of economic activity at the destination country. However, different from this literature, Equation 9 is dynamic, and thus, its right hand side represents future expected percentage changes in variables.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Since future prices are endogenous variables that can change with shocks that occur unexpectedly over time, the corresponding unexpected changes are captured by  $v_{nit+1,t}$ 's.

 $<sup>^{6}</sup>$ It is important to emphasize that Equation 10 holds independent of having an endowment or a production economy. In particular, having a production side in an alternative model would only put more structure (in equilibrium) on future expected changes in real consumption.

#### 2.2 Implications for Trade Deficits

Using the model introduced so far, as shown in details in the Appendix, an expression can be found for the total trade deficit of country n as a percentage of its Gross Domestic Product (GDP) as follows:

$$\underbrace{100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} \Delta D_{nt+1}}{GDP_{ne}}}_{\text{Currentiating Trade Definit}} = \underbrace{100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} (1-\theta) \left( \begin{array}{c} M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{iit+1} \right\} \\ -X_{nt} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{nnt+1} \right\} \end{array} \right)}_{GDP_{ne}}$$
(11)

Cumulative Changes due to Effective Terms of Trade as % of GDP

$$+100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} (1-\theta) \left( \begin{array}{c} M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\} \\ -X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{int+1} \right\} \end{array} \right)}{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Relative Trade Costs as % of GDP

+ 100 × 
$$\frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} \left( \begin{array}{c} M_{nt} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{nt+1} \right\} \\ -X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{it+1} \right\} \end{array} \right)}{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Macroeconomic Developments as % of GDP

$$+\underbrace{100\times\underbrace{\sum_{t=1979}^{e}\left(\begin{array}{c}M_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\omega_{nit}\left(v_{nit+1,t}+o\left(\|f_{nit}^{2}\|\right)\right)\\-X_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\lambda_{int}\left(v_{int+1,t}+o\left(\|f_{int}^{2}\|\right)\right)\end{array}\right)}_{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Residuals

where  $D_{nt}$  represents the difference between the *levels* of total imports and total exports of country n at time t, satisfying  $D_{nt} = M_{nt} - X_{nt}$  with  $M_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{nit}C_{nit}$  representing total imports and  $X_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{int}C_{int}$  representing total exports of country n at time t. The share of imports in country n coming from source country i at time t is given by  $\omega_{nit} = \frac{P_{nit}C_{nit}}{M_{nt}}$ as it satisfies  $\sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} = 1$ , whereas the share of exports in country n sent to destination country i at time t is given by  $\lambda_{int} = \frac{P_{int}C_{int}}{X_{nt}}$  as it satisfies  $\sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} = 1$ . Finally,  $o(||f_{nit}^2||)$ 's represent terms that are equal to or higher than second order due to using Taylor series of  $\Delta \log(x_{t+1}) = \frac{\Delta x_{t+1}}{x_t} + o(||f^2||)$  as the sum of logs is not equal to the log of sums according to Jensen's inequality. The left hand side of Equation 11 represents the cumulative trade deficits (in levels) of country n at period e measured starting from the year 1979. The starting date of 1979 has been chosen not only to have more countries with positive trade observations in the sample but also due to the fact that the trade openness and thus the trade deficits of most countries have been virtually around zero at that time. The latter is important for technical reasons, because our measure of cumulative changes in trade deficit ( $\sum_{t=1979}^{e} \Delta D_{nt+1}$ ) would be exactly equal to the level of trade deficit ( $D_{nt+1}$ ) when the initial trade deficit (in 1979) is set equal to zero as we proceed in this paper.<sup>7</sup> Finally,  $GDP_{ne}$  represents GDP of country n at any time e.

As is evident in Equation 11, the *level* of trade deficit (measured by the cumulative changes in trade deficit) of country n can be decomposed into components as a percentage of its GDP. The first component, the cumulative change in effective terms of trade, represents the difference between the weighted average of import prices and the weighted average of export prices, both measured at the source country; it can be connected to policies such as structural reforms to adjust export prices (as in Chinn and Ito (2007), Alfaro, Kalemli-Ozcan, and Volosovych (2008), Cheung, Furceri, and Rusticelli (2013) or Culiuc and Kyobe (2017)) or foreign exchange intervention (as in Bayoumi, Gagnon, and Saborowski (2015), Blanchard, Adler, and Filho (2015), or Carney (2017)). The second component measures the effects due to the relative trade costs of the country, defined as the changes in the weighted average of import trade costs and the weighted average of export trade costs; it can be connected to the standard trade policies such as changes in tariffs/duties or investment in transportation technology (as in Barattieri (2014), Obstfeld (2016), Reyes-Heroles (2016), Alessandria and Choi (2018), Eichengreen (2018), or Boz, Li, and Zhang (2019)). The third component compares the relative macroeconomic developments of the country with respect to its export partners; it can be connected to macroeconomic policies as in IMF (2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>The investigation based on countries of which initial trade deficit in 1979 was not around zero still captures the changes in their trade deficit starting from 1979, although the decomposition of cumulative changes *before* 1979 cannot be achieved. According to the data described below, out of 188 countries, the following countries have experienced trade deficits or surpluses more than 10% of their GDP as of 1979: Belize, Benin, Bermuda, Brunei Darussalam, Burkina Faso, Cabo Verde, Congo, Republic of, Costa Rica, Dominica, Egypt, Fiji, Gabon, Gambia, The, Greenland, Guinea-Bissau, Indonesia, Israel, Jordan, Malawi, Malaysia, Mali, Malta, Morocco, Nicaragua, Nigeria, Pakistan, Portugal, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, Saudi Arabia, Seychelles, Singapore, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Togo, Trinidad and Tobago, United Arab Emirates.

#### **3** Estimation Methodology and Data

The decomposition given in Equation 11 requires knowledge of future expected changes in source prices represented by  $(1 - \theta) E_t \{\Delta \log P_{iit+1}\}$ 's that are source-country and time specific, future expected changes in bilateral trade costs represented by  $(1 - \theta) E_t \{\Delta \log \tau_{nit+1}\}$ 's that are source- and destination-country and time specific, future expected changes in macroeconomic developments represented by  $E_t \{\Delta \log (Z_{nt+1})\}$ 's that are destination-country and time specific, and future expected changes in residuals represented by  $v_{nit+1,t}$  for all n, i, t for both imports and exports; these are estimated by using the implications of the model for bilateral imports and bilateral exports. The remaining required information (for the decomposition in Equation 11) on total imports of  $M_{nt}$ 's, total exports of  $X_{nt}$ 's, import shares of  $\omega_{nit}$ 's and export shares  $\lambda_{int}$ 's are directly obtained from the data.<sup>8</sup>

Based on this background, regarding bilateral imports, we estimate Equation 9 as a panel by using data on bilateral imports according to the following expression for country n:

$$\underbrace{\Delta \log \left( P_{nit+1} C_{nit+1} \right)}_{\text{Bilateral Import Data}} = \underbrace{\left( 1 - \theta \right) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{iit+1} \right\}}_{\text{Source-Time Fixed Effects}} + \underbrace{\left( 1 - \theta \right) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\}}_{\text{Bilateral Trade Costs}}$$
(12)

+ 
$$\underbrace{E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \left( Z_{nt+1} \right) \right\}}_{\text{Destination-Time Fixed Effects}}$$
 +  $\underbrace{v_{nit+1,t}}_{\text{Residuals}}$ 

where the corresponding fitted values are effectively used in the decomposition of trade deficits given in Equation 11.

Similarly, regarding bilateral exports, we estimate Equation 8 as a panel by using data on bilateral exports according to the following expression for country n:

$$\underbrace{\Delta \log \left( P_{int+1} C_{int+1} \right)}_{\text{Bilateral Export Data}} = \underbrace{(1-\theta) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{nnt+1} \right\}}_{\text{Source-Time Fixed Effects}} + \underbrace{(1-\theta) E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{int+1} \right\}}_{\text{Bilateral Trade Costs}} + \underbrace{E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \left( Z_{it+1} \right) \right\}}_{t=1} + v_{int+1,t}$$
(13)

where, again, the corresponding fitted values are effectively used in the decomposition of trade deficits given in Equation 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Information on  $o\left(\left\|f_{nit}^2\right\|\right)$ 's is also required, which can be obtained by using  $\Delta \log(x_{t+1}) = \frac{\Delta x_{t+1}}{x_t} + o\left(\left\|f^2\right\|\right)$  as discussed above.

In both estimations, percentage changes in trade costs are represented by dyadic fixed effects (that capture any importer-specific, exporter-specific, or importer-exporter-specific percentage changes in trade costs by construction), together with dummies for common currency and free trade agreements (that are time-varying by construction) interacting with dyadic fixed effects.<sup>9</sup> The latter interactions result in capturing the effects of having a common currency or a free trade agreement for each country pair individually (e.g., they can distinguish between the effects of The North American Free Trade Agreement between the U.S. and Canada versus those of The European Free Trade Association between Norway and Switzerland). Source-time fixed effects capture the effects of future expected percentage changes in source-specific prices, while destination-time fixed effects capture the effects of future the effects of future expected percentage changes in destination-specific macroeconomic developments.<sup>10</sup>

Trade data are obtained from the International Monetary Fund's Direction of Trade Statistics (DOTS) for bilateral imports  $P_{nit}C_{nit}$ 's, bilateral exports  $P_{int}C_{int}$ 's, total imports  $M_{nt}$ 's, and total exports  $X_{nt}$ 's for the years between 1979-2015. Estimation results, as well as  $M_{nt}$ 's and  $X_{nt}$ 's, are further combined with shares of imports given by  $\omega_{nit}$ 's and shares of exports given by  $\lambda_{int}$ 's, both obtained from the same data set, to achieve the decomposition of total trade deficits in Equation 11. The gravity variables are obtained from the economic geography database of CEPII (Centre d'Etudes Prospectives et d'informations Internationales) for the very same time period. The combination of the two data sets results in having data for 188 countries in estimations.

It is important to emphasize that we estimate bilateral imports and bilateral exports in two separate estimations. This is not only to make sure that we match the total trade deficit of each country through our trade deficit expression (of Equation 11) but also to capture the inconsistency between partner country data as indicated by DOTS documentation (i.e., imports from country i to country j may not be equal to exports from country j to country i). One reason for the latter inconsistency is the time of recording, which may be different for the source country (recorded when the shipment leaves) and the destination country (recorded when the shipment arrives). Since shipment takes time, these recordings can fall into two different recording periods (e.g., source recording may represent the current year, while destination recording may represent the following year). Another reason is the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Considering these time-varying gravity variables, together with time-varying import and export shares, results in having time-varying contribution of trade costs in Equation 11.

 $<sup>^{10}</sup>$ For sure, alternative model details (e.g., see Olivero and Yotov (2012) where capital accumulation is considered) would result in alternative structural interpretation of these fixed effects, although the estimated fixed effects would remain the same across alternative model specifications. Accordingly, the interpretation of the results in this paper should be considered based on the ingredients of the model introduced.

way that imports and exports are valued; e.g., apart from imports being measured as cost, insurance, and freight (CIF), and exports are measured as free on board (FOB), alternative currency conversions or anti-evasion procedures can lead into having inconsistencies between partner country data. Having alternative coverage practices is another reason, where certain confidential items such as for military or government may or may not be recorded by source or destination countries. By having alternative regressions for bilateral imports and bilateral exports, our empirical strategy captures all of these details by construction.

#### 4 Empirical Results for Individual Countries

#### 4.1 Results for the Full Sample

The methodology introduced above provides results for all 188 countries in our data set, although we focus on the U.S. and its four major trade partners, namely China, Canada, Mexico and Japan, in this section. The results for other countries are given in the Online Appendix. The decomposition of the trade deficit for these countries are given in Figure 1 over the sample period, while the averages (across years) for alternative periods are given for the same countries in Table 1.

We start with investigating the U.S., where trade deficit has been about 3% of its GDP on average between 1980-2015 according to Table 1. The majority of the U.S. trade deficit can be attributed to relative trade costs, followed by effective terms of trade, while relative macroeconomic developments have mostly worked toward balancing trade. The contribution of relative trade costs to the U.S. trade deficit has gradually increased over time, where effective terms of trade has almost always contributed positively to the U.S. trade deficit, while the negative contribution of relative macroeconomic developments has been in the picture except for early 2000s.

In contrast, China has experienced a trade surplus (i.e., negative trade deficit) of about 2% of its GDP on average between 1980-2015, for which negative effective terms of trade have contributed the most, followed by negative relative trade costs. Although relative macroeconomic developments have been positive in China, their magnitude has not been enough to have trade deficits. Starting from late 1990s, China has started experiencing positive relative macroeconomic developments dominated by negative effective terms of trade, which has resulted in a trade surplus. Compared to the U.S. that has experienced positive and dominant relative trade costs almost at all times, China's relative trade costs have always contributed negatively, suggesting heterogeneity of contributing components across countries.

Different from the U.S. that has experienced a trade deficit and China that has experienced a trade surplus between 1980-2015, Canada and Mexico have experienced relatively balanced trade measures during the same period. However, the components responsible for Canada versus Mexico are highly different. In particular, Canada's relatively balanced trade can be attributed to positive effective terms of trade and positive relative macroeconomic developments compensated by negative relative trade costs, whereas relatively balanced trade of Mexico can be attributed to positive relative relative trade costs and positive relative macroeconomic developments compensated by negative effective terms of trade. Contribution of trade costs has always been negative for Canada, while it has always been positive for Mexico. Canada's effective terms of trade have turned from positive to negative in 2000s, whereas those of Mexico have always been negative.

One interesting comparison can be achieved between Mexico and Japan. In particular, as opposed to Mexico, Japan's relative macroeconomic developments have contributed negatively, while its effective terms of trade have contributed positively almost always. Nevertheless, on average between 1980-2015, Japan has experienced a trade surplus, where positive contribution of effective terms of trade has been dominated by negative contributions of relative macroeconomic developments and relative trade costs.

The average decomposition of trade imbalances during the sample period is given for all 188 countries in the Online Appendix Table A.1, where similar country-specific investigations can be achieved. Country-specific decompositions over time are provided as figures in the Online Appendix as well.

#### 4.2 **Results for Subsamples**

The results for subsamples of the U.S. and its four major trade partners representing periods before and after the establishment of WTO in 1995 are summarized as averages across years in Table 1. Since the main function of WTO is to ensure through global rules that trade flows as smoothly, predictably and freely as possible, investigating these subsamples provides insights about how the establishment of WTO might have changed the decomposition of trade deficits across countries.

As is evident, increases in both the U.S. trade deficit and the trade surplus (i.e., negative trade deficit) of China after WTO can be attributed to changes in their effective terms of trade and relative trade costs, suggesting that opposite changes in trade balances of these countries coincide with WTO.

Trade deficit of Canada has been mostly stable between subsamples, since higher contribution of relative macroeconomic developments after WTO has been compensated by lower contributions of effective terms of trade and trade costs. Trade surplus of Mexico before WTO has turned into trade surplus after WTO, since lower contribution of effective terms of trade has not been enough to compensate for higher contributions of relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments. Since the establishment of WTO also coincides with the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), it is suggested that trade deficits of countries can be affected by alternative factors following freer trade.

Finally, Japan has experienced trade surpluses in both subsamples as the significant higher contribution of effective terms of trade has been compensated by lower contributions of relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments after WTO.

### 5 Empirical Results for Country Groups

#### 5.1 Results for the Full Sample

After showing that countries have distinct decompositions of their trade deficits, we continue with providing results for country groups by distinguishing between all countries, OECD countries, non-OECD countries, and world regions. Although we have the results for all 188 countries in our data set (as given in the Online Appendix), to control for outliers and thus have a healthy summary, we ignore countries that have trade deficit or surplus measures corresponding to more than 50% of their GDP at any year during the sample period. The decomposition of the cumulative trade deficit for these country groups are given in Figure 2 over the sample period, while the corresponding averages are given in Table 2.

The average country has experienced a trade deficit of about 4% of its GDP, for which relative trade costs have contributed the most, followed by relative macroeconomic developments. When countries are split as OECD versus non-OECD countries, the average of the former has experienced a trade surplus of about 1% of its GDP, whereas the average of the latter has experienced a trade deficit of about 6% of its GDP. Trade deficit of the average non-OECD country can mostly be attributed to relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments, whereas trade surplus of the average OECD country can be attributed to negative effective terms of trade and negative relative macroeconomic developments.

Regarding world regions (based on World Bank country classifications), South Asian and Sub-Saharan African countries have experienced higher trade deficits that are mostly accounted for by relative macroeconomic developments for the former and relative trade costs for the latter. In contrast, European and Central Asian countries have experienced lower trade deficits that can be attributed to their effective terms of trade.

As shown in Figure 2, over time, the average country has experienced a trade deficit almost always during the sample period, with positive contributions of relative trade costs at all times, together with positive contributions of relative macroeconomic developments starting from late 1990s. The average OECD country has experienced a trade surplus almost at all times, where effective terms of trade have started pushing toward a trade deficit starting after the 2008 recession. In contrast, the average non-OECD country has experienced a trade deficit at all times, with positive contributions of relative trade costs at all times and relative macroeconomic developments starting from late 1990s. Similar comparisons can be achieved for world regions.

#### 5.2 Results for Subsamples

The results for subsamples of country groups representing periods before and after WTO are summarized as averages across years in Table 3. The establishment of WTO coincides with higher trade deficits for non-OECD countries that is accounted for by relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments, although trade surplus of OECD countries and its components have been stable over time.

Regarding world regions, South Asian and Sub-Saharan African countries have experienced the highest increase in their trade deficits that can be mostly explained by relative macroeconomic developments for the former and relative trade costs for the latter. It is implied that the establishment of WTO coincides with heterogenous changes across country groups regarding the components of their trade deficits.

#### 5.3 Cross-Country Investigation

Although results on individual countries or country groups that have been depicted so far provide useful information for country-specific or group-specific policies, we would like to investigate in this section whether there are any systematic patterns across countries regarding the decomposition of their trade deficits. Similar to studies such as by Lane and Milesi-Ferretti (2002), this is achieved by showing the individual explanatory power of each component for the trade deficit. To control for outliers, we again ignore countries that have trade deficit or surplus measures corresponding to more than 50% of their GDP at any year during the sample period. The results representing all countries are given in Figure 3, where it is evident that relative trade costs are correlated the most with trade deficits, followed by relative macroeconomic developments. The correlation between country-specific trade deficits and effective terms of trade as well as preferences/residuals, is almost none. Across OECD countries, as shown in Figure 4, there is weak evidence for the correlation between trade deficits and relative trade costs, together with relative macroeconomic developments, whereas the correlation between trade deficits and relative trade costs is much stronger for non-OECD countries in Figure 5. Overall, both the average (across countries) magnitude of trade imbalances and the cross-country heterogeneity can mostly be attributed to relative trade costs of countries over time.

#### 6 Concluding Remarks and Policy Implications

Based on implications of a dynamic trade model that incorporates implicitly additively separable nonhomothetic CES preferences, this paper has shown that the total trade deficit of a country can be decomposed into changes due to effective terms of trade, relative trade costs, and relative macroeconomic developments. Using bilateral imports and bilateral exports data, estimations have been achieved for 188 countries.

Country-specific results have shown that each country has different patterns over time regarding the contribution of each component in the decomposition of total trade deficits. For example, the U.S. trade deficit is mostly explained by the positive contributions of relative trade costs followed by those of effective terms of trade, whereas the negative Chinese trade deficit (i.e., its trade surplus) is mostly explained by its negative effective terms of trade, despite high and positive contributions of its relative macroeconomic developments.

On average across countries, relative trade costs followed by relative macroeconomic developments have contributed the most to the magnitude (of the trade deficit) during the sample period. While the average OECD country has experienced a trade surplus that is mostly explained by effective terms of trade followed by relative macroeconomic developments, the average non-OECD country has experienced a trade deficit that is mostly explained by relative trade costs followed by relative macroeconomic developments. When subsamples are considered, it has been shown that the establishment of WTO coincides with higher trade deficits for non-OECD countries that are accounted for by relative trade costs and relative macroeconomic developments, although trade surplus of OECD countries and its components have been stable over time. A cross-country investigation has further shown that the heterogeneity across countries regarding their trade deficits is mostly connected to their relative trade costs (followed by relative macroeconomic developments), also reflecting the heterogeneity across non-OECD countries.

The three components obtained by the decomposition introduced in this paper can further be connected to certain policy tools suggested by the existing literature. First, effective terms of trade of a country can be affected by structural reforms to adjust export prices (implied by Chinn and Ito (2007), Alfaro, Kalemli-Ozcan, and Volosovych (2008), Cheung, Furceri, and Rusticelli (2013) or Culiuc and Kyobe (2017)) or by an exchange rate policy (see Bayoumi, Gagnon, and Saborowski (2015), Blanchard, Adler, and Filho (2015), or Carney (2017)). Hence, for a given exchange rate, since a country cannot affect the source prices of its imports (that are determined at the source country), its trade deficit caused by its effective terms of trade can be rebalanced by policies that can reduce its export prices. Such policies may include increasing productivity through product and labor market reforms (as in Cacciatore, Duval, Fiori, and Ghironi (2016a) or Cacciatore, Duval, Fiori, and Ghironi (2016b)), reducing market frictions by improving competitiveness (as in Chen, Milesi-Ferretti, and Tressel (2013)), for example, by enhancing schooling/training, broadening the skill base of the labor force, immigration policies, or reforming wage bargaining mechanisms. Similarly, trade surplus of a country caused by its effective terms of trade can be rebalanced by removing export subsidies (if any) that can alternatively be utilized, for example, as investment projects by the government. Alternatively, trade deficit (surplus) of a country caused by its effective terms of trade can also be rebalanced by the depreciation (appreciation) of its currency, for example, by a foreign exchange intervention or by abandoning currency manipulations (if any).<sup>11</sup>

Second, relative trade costs a country can be connected to its bilateral protectionist policies or its composition of trading partners (that can be determined by bilateral/multilateral trade agreements) as in studies such as by Barattieri (2014), Obstfeld (2016), Reyes-Heroles (2016), Alessandria and Choi (2018), Eichengreen (2018) or Boz, Li, and Zhang (2019). Therefore, if trade deficit of a country is due to its relative trade costs, it can be balanced, for example, by negotiating with export partners for lower tariffs/duties, or trade surplus of a country can be rebalanced, for example, by reducing its own tariffs/duties applied to its imports.

Third, if trade imbalance of a country is due to its macroeconomic developments capturing its relative economic activity as well as its relative saving decision with respect to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>See Ricci, Milesi-Ferretti, and Lee (2013) who provide strong evidence for the relationship between terms of trade and real exchange rate.

its export partners, macroeconomic policies can be used for rebalancing (see IMF (2018)). For example, trade deficit of a country can be rebalanced by fiscal consolidation or monetary/credit tightening, while trade surplus of a country can be rebalanced by expansionary fiscal stance or policies to foster domestic credit growth. Overall, understanding the source of trade imbalances is the key to optimal policy for rebalancing, and the decomposition achieved in this paper has provided insights through an international trade approach in a dynamic framework.

### 7 Appendix

#### 7.1 Derivation of Trade Deficits

Since the sum of logs is not equal to the log of sums due to Jensen's inequality, when Equation 8 is estimated (as is standard in the literature), one cannot take the sum of log bilateral trade deficits (implied by Equation 8) to obtain an expression for total trade deficit. Accordingly, in order to connect the total trade deficit of a country to the components of its log bilateral trade, we consider an alternative approach of using Taylor series for log bilateral trade expressions. To do so, total trade deficit of country n at time t can be written as follows:

$$\underbrace{D_{nt}}_{\text{Trade Deficit}} = \underbrace{M_{nt}}_{\text{Total Imports}} - \underbrace{X_{nt}}_{\text{Total Exports}}$$
(14)

where  $M_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{nit}C_{nit}$  represents total imports, and  $X_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{int}C_{int}$  represents total exports of country *n*. By using Taylor series of  $\Delta \log (x_{t+1}) = \frac{\Delta x_{t+1}}{x_t} + o(||f^2||)$  for the left hand side of Equation 9, where  $o(||f^2||)$  represents terms that are equal to or higher than  $2^{nd}$  order, it can be rewritten as follows:

$$\frac{\Delta (P_{nit+1}C_{nit+1})}{P_{nit}C_{nit}} = (1-\theta) E_t \{\Delta \log P_{iit+1}\} + (1-\theta) E_t \{\Delta \log \tau_{nit+1}\} + E_t \{\Delta \log (Z_{nt+1})\} + v_{nit+1,t} + o\left(\left\|f_{nit}^2\right\|\right)$$
(15)

Defining  $\omega_{nit} = \frac{P_{nit}C_{nit}}{M_{nt}}$  in country *n* as the share of imports coming from source country *i* at time *t* that satisfies  $\sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} = 1$ , an expression (in levels) can be found for future changes in total imports of country *n* after multiplying both sides of Equation 15 by  $\omega_{nit}$  and using

 $M_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{nit} C_{nit}$  as follows:

$$\Delta M_{nt+1} = (1-\theta) M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{iit+1} \right\} + (1-\theta) M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\}$$
(16)  
+  $M_{nt} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{nt+1} \right\} + M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} \left( v_{nit+1,t} + o\left( \left\| f_{nit}^2 \right\| \right) \right)$ 

Similarly, after defining  $\lambda_{int} = \frac{P_{int}C_{int}}{X_{nt}}$  in country *n* as the share of exports sent to destination country *i* at time *t* that satisfies  $\sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} = 1$ , an expression (in levels) can be found for future changes in total exports of country *n* by using  $X_{nt} = \sum_{i \neq n} P_{int}C_{int}$  as follows:

$$\Delta X_{nt+1} = (1-\theta) X_{nt} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{nnt+1} \right\} + (1-\theta) X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{int+1} \right\}$$
(17)  
+  $X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{it+1} \right\} + X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} \left( v_{int+1,t} + o\left( \left\| f_{int}^2 \right\| \right) \right)$ 

Combining Equations 14, 16 and 17 results in the following decomposition for changes in trade deficit of country n in levels:

$$\underbrace{\Delta D_{nt+1}}_{\text{Changes in Trade Deficit}} = \underbrace{(1-\theta) M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{iit+1} \right\} - (1-\theta) X_{nt} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log P_{nnt+1} \right\}}_{\text{Changes due to Effective Terms of Trade}}$$
(18)

$$+ (1-\theta) M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\} - (1-\theta) X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{int+1} \right\}$$

Changes due to Relative Trade Costs

$$+ M_{nt}E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{nt+1} \right\} - X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int}E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{it+1} \right\}$$

Changes due to Relative Macroeconomic Developments

$$+\underbrace{\left(M_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\omega_{nit}\left(v_{nit+1,t}+o\left(\left\|f_{nit}^{2}\right\|\right)\right)-X_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\lambda_{int}\left(v_{int+1,t}+o\left(\left\|f_{int}^{2}\right\|\right)\right)\right)}_{i\neq n}$$

Changes due to Residuals

Since changes in trade deficit are represented by a flow variable  $(\Delta D_{nt+1})$ , the *cumulative* changes in the trade deficit (as a stock variable that is comparable to the *level* of trade deficit,  $D_{nt}$ ) can be calculated as  $\sum_{t=0}^{e} \Delta D_{nt+1}$  for any end period e > 0. Hence, the *level* of trade deficit can be decomposed into cumulative changes in terms of trade, cumulative changes in relative trade costs, and cumulative changes in relative economic sizes (and thus macroeconomic developments). In particular, for any end year (each represented by e), since countries have different economic sizes, the cumulative decomposition (implied by Equation 18) can be represented as a percentage of GDP according to the following expression:

$$100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} \Delta D_{nt+1}}{GDP_{ne}} = \underbrace{100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} (1-\theta) \left(\begin{array}{c} M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{\Delta \log P_{iit+1}\right\} \\ -X_{nt} E_t \left\{\Delta \log P_{nnt+1}\right\} \end{array}\right)}_{GDP_{ne}}$$
(19)

Cumulative Changes due to Effective Terms of Trade as % of GDP

$$+100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} (1-\theta) \left( \begin{array}{c} M_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \omega_{nit} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{nit+1} \right\} \\ -X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log \tau_{int+1} \right\} \end{array} \right)}{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Relative Trade Costs as % of GDP

+ 
$$100 \times \frac{\sum_{t=1979}^{e} \left( \frac{M_{nt}E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{nt+1} \right\}}{-X_{nt} \sum_{i \neq n} \lambda_{int} E_t \left\{ \Delta \log Z_{it+1} \right\}} \right)}{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Macroeconomic Developments as % of GDP

$$+\underbrace{100\times\underbrace{\sum_{t=1979}^{e}\left(\begin{array}{c}M_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\omega_{nit}\left(v_{nit+1,t}+o\left(\|f_{nit}^{2}\|\right)\right)\\-X_{nt}\sum_{i\neq n}\lambda_{int}\left(v_{int+1,t}+o\left(\|f_{int}^{2}\|\right)\right)\end{array}\right)}_{GDP_{ne}}$$

Cumulative Changes due to Residuals

where the starting date has been set to t = 1979, and  $GDP_{ne}$  represents GDP of country n at time e.

#### References

- ALESSANDRIA, G., AND H. CHOI (2018): "The Dynamics of the US Trade Balance and the Real Exchange Rate: The J Curve and Trade Costs?," Discussion paper, mimeo.
- ALFARO, L., S. KALEMLI-OZCAN, AND V. VOLOSOVYCH (2008): "Why doesn't capital flow from rich to poor countries? An empirical investigation," *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 90(2), 347–368.
- ALLEN, T., C. ARKOLAKIS, AND Y. TAKAHASHI (2018): "Universal Gravity," *Journal of Political Economy*, forthcoming.
- ANDERSON, J. E. (1979): "A Theoretical Foundation for the Gravity Equation," *The American Economic Review*, 69(1), 106–116.
- ANDERSON, J. E., AND E. VAN WINCOOP (2003): "Gravity with gravitas: a solution to the border puzzle," *The American Economic Review*, 93(1), 170–192.
- ANGELETOS, G.-M., AND V. PANOUSI (2011): "Financial Integration, Entrepreneurial Risk and Global Dynamics," *Journal of Economic Theory*, 146(3), 863–896.
- ANTRAS, P., AND R. J. CABALLERO (2009): "Trade and Capital Flows: A Financial Frictions Perspective," *Journal of Political Economy*, 117(4), 701–744.
- ARKOLAKIS, C., S. A. DEMIDOVA, P. J. KLENOW, AND A. RODRIGUEZ-CLARE (2008): "Endogenous Variety and the Gains from Trade," *The American Economic Review*, 98(2), 444–450.
- BARATTIERI, A. (2014): "Comparative advantage, service trade, and global imbalances," Journal of International Economics, 92(1), 1–13.
- BAYOUMI, T., J. GAGNON, AND C. SABOROWSKI (2015): "Official financial flows, capital mobility, and global imbalances," *Journal of International Money and Finance*, 52, 146– 174.
- BERNARD, A. B., J. EATON, J. B. JENSEN, AND S. S. KORTUM (2003): "Plants and Productivity in International Trade," *The American Economic Review*, 93(4), 1268–1290.
- BLANCHARD, O., G. ADLER, AND I. D. C. FILHO (2015): "Can Foreign Exchange Intervention Stem Exchange Rate Pressures from Global Capital Flow Shocks?," Working Paper 21427, National Bureau of Economic Research.

- BLANCHARD, O., AND G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI (2012): "(Why) should current account balances be reduced?," *IMF Economic Review*, 60(1), 139–150.
- BLANCHARD, O. J., AND G.-M. MILESI-FERRETTI (2009): *Global imbalances: in mid-stream?*, no. 2009-2029. International Monetary Fund.
- BOZ, M. E., M. LI, AND H. ZHANG (2019): Effective Trade Costs and the Current Account: An Empirical Analysis. International Monetary Fund Working Paper WP/19/8.
- CABALLERO, J. A. (2016): "Do Surges in International Capital Inflows Influence the Likelihood of Banking Crises?," *The Economic Journal*, 126(591), 281–316.
- CABALLERO, R. J., E. FARHI, AND P.-O. GOURINCHAS (2008): "An equilibrium model of" global imbalances" and low interest rates," *American economic review*, 98(1), 358–93.
- CABALLERO, R. J., AND G. LORENZONI (2014): "Persistent appreciations and overshooting: A normative analysis," *IMF Economic Review*, 62(1), 1–47.
- CACCIATORE, M., R. DUVAL, G. FIORI, AND F. GHIRONI (2016a): "Market reforms in the time of imbalance," *Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control*, 72, 69–93.
- (2016b): "Short-term pain for long-term gain: Market deregulation and monetary policy in small open economies," *Journal of International Money and Finance*, 68, 358–385.
- CALIENDO, L., AND F. PARRO (2015): "Estimates of the Trade and Welfare Effects of NAFTA," *The Review of Economic Studies*, 82(1), 1–44.
- CARNEY, M. (2017): "A fine balance," Speech given at Mansion House and available here http://www.bankofengland.co.uk/publications/Documents/speeches/2017/speech983.pdf.
- CATÃO, L. A., AND G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI (2014): "External liabilities and crises," Journal of International Economics, 94(1), 18–32.
- CHEN, R., G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI, AND T. TRESSEL (2013): "External imbalances in the eurozone," *Economic Policy*, 28(73), 101–142.
- CHEUNG, C., D. FURCERI, AND E. RUSTICELLI (2013): "Structural and cyclical factors behind current account balances," *Review of International Economics*, 21(5), 923–944.
- CHINN, M. D., AND H. ITO (2007): "Current account balances, financial development and institutions: Assaying the world saving glut," *Journal of international money and Finance*, 26(4), 546–569.

- COMIN, D. A., D. LASHKARI, AND M. MESTIERI (2015): "Structural Change with Long-run Income and Price Effects," Working Paper 21595, National Bureau of Economic Research.
- CULIUC, A., AND A. KYOBE (2017): "Structural Reforms and External Rebalancing," *IMF* Working Paper: Structural Reforms and External Rebalancing, 17(182).
- DEKLE, R., J. EATON, AND S. KORTUM (2007): "Unbalanced trade," American Economic Review, 97(2), 351–355.
- DEKLE, R., J. EATON, AND S. S. KORTUM (2008): "Global Rebalancing with Gravity: Measuring the Burden of Adjustment," *Imf Staff Papers*, 55(3), 511–540.
- DI GIOVANNI, J., AND A. A. LEVCHENKO (2009): "Putting the Parts Together: Trade, Vertical Linkages, and Business Cycle Comovement," *American Economic Journal: Macroeconomics*, 2(2), 95–124.
- EATON, J., AND S. KORTUM (2002): "Technology, geography, and trade," *Econometrica*, 70(5), 1741–1779.
- EICHENGREEN, B. (2018): "Trade Policy and the Macroeconomy," *IMF Economic Review*.
- FELBERMAYR, G., AND Y. V. YOTOV (2019): "From theory to policy with gravitas: A solution to the mystery of the excess trade balances," Discussion paper, Kiel Working Papers.
- GALI, J., AND T. MONACELLI (2005): "Monetary policy and exchange rate volatility in a small open economy," *The Review of Economic Studies*, 72(3), 707–734.
- GOURINCHAS, P.-O., AND H. REY (2014): "External adjustment, global imbalances, valuation effects," in *Handbook of International Economics*, vol. 4, pp. 585–645. Elsevier.
- HANOCH, G. (1975): "Production and demand models with direct or indirect implicit additivity," *Econometrica (pre-1986)*, 43(3), 395.
- IMF (2018): "External Sector Report: Tackling Global Imbalances amid Rising Trade Tensions," International Monetary Fund, Washington, DC, July.
- KRUGMAN, P. (1980): "Scale Economies, Product Differentiation, and the Pattern of Trade," The American Economic Review, 70(5), 950–959.

- LANE, P. R., AND G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI (2001): "The external wealth of nations: measures of foreign assets and liabilities for industrial and developing countries," *Journal* of International Economics, 55(2), 263–294.
- LANE, P. R., AND G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI (2002): "External wealth, the trade balance, and the real exchange rate," *European Economic Review*, 46(6), 1049–1071.
- MELITZ, M. J. (2003): "The impact of trade on intra-industry reallocations and aggregate industry productivity," *Econometrica*, 71(6), 1695–1725.
- MENDOZA, E. G., V. QUADRINI, AND J.-V. RIOS-RULL (2009): "Financial integration, financial development, and global imbalances," *Journal of Political economy*, 117(3), 371– 416.
- MILESI-FERRETTI, G. M., AND A. RAZIN (2000): "Current account reversals and currency crises: empirical regularities," in *Currency crises*, pp. 285–323. University of Chicago Press.
- OBSTFELD, M. (2016): "Tariffs Do More Harm than Good at Home," *IMFBlog*, September 8.
- (2018): "Addressing global imbalances requires cooperation," *IMFBlog*, July 24.
- OBSTFELD, M., AND K. ROGOFF (1995): "The intertemporal approach to the current account," *Handbook of international economics*, 3, 1731–1799.
- OLIVERO, M. P., AND Y. V. YOTOV (2012): "Dynamic gravity: endogenous country size and asset accumulation," *Canadian Journal of Economics/Revue canadienne d'économique*, 45(1), 64–92.
- REYES-HEROLES, R. (2016): "The Role of Trade Costs in the Surge of Trade Imbalances," *mimeo*.
- RICCI, L. A., G. M. MILESI-FERRETTI, AND J. LEE (2013): "Real exchange rates and fundamentals: a cross-country perspective," *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking*, 45(5), 845–865.

Table	1 - Decompo	sition of Trac	le Deficits: I	Five Countries	
	TD	ToT	тс	MD	Res.
Period: 1980-2015					
United States	2.957	1.793	3.484	-1.646	-0.673
China	-2.124	-11.470	-2.450	7.240	4.557
Canada	-0.671	2.471	-4.904	6.381	-4.620
Mexico	0.354	-10.174	6.505	9.115	-5.091
Japan	-1.725	6.005	-2.203	-5.447	-0.080
Period: 1980-1994					
United States	1.384	0.712	0.949	-1.398	1.120
China	0.001	-2.805	-1.281	-0.893	4.981
Canada	-0.568	4.380	-2.122	2.305	-5.131
Mexico	-1.775	-4.487	1.178	4.638	-3.104
Japan	-2.537	-0.768	-0.996	-1.667	0.894
Period: 1995-2015					
United States	4.081	2.564	5.294	-1.823	-1.954
China	-3.642	-17.660	-3.286	13.049	4.254
Canada	-0.745	1.107	-6.890	9.293	-4.254
Mexico	1.876	-14.236	10.310	12.312	-6.510
Japan	-1.145	10.842	-3.065	-8.147	-0.776

Notes: TD stands for trade deficit, ToT stands for relative terms of trade, TC stands for relative trade costs, MD stands for relative macro developments and Res. stands for residuals. Values are in percentage of GDP representing averages during the corresponding time period.

Table 2 - Decomposition of Trade Deficits: Country Groups										
	TD	ToT	TC	MD	Res.					
Period: 1980-2015										
All Countries	3.924	-0.757	2.551	2.074	0.057					
Non-OECD	6.280	-0.411	3.613	3.385	-0.307					
OECD	-0.962	-1.477	0.349	-0.646	0.811					
East Asia & Pacific	1.953	-2.688	1.856	3.742	-0.957					
Europe & Central Asia	1.071	-0.621	0.632	1.340	-0.280					
Latin America & Caribbean	4.886	-2.537	3.923	3.626	-0.127					
Middle East & North Africa	3.757	-0.126	4.069	3.845	-4.031					
North America	1.143	2.132	-0.710	2.368	-2.646					
South Asia	8.393	1.040	1.257	3.978	2.118					
Sub-Saharan Africa	7.395	0.689	4.782	-0.180	2.104					

Notes: TD stands for trade deficit, ToT stands for relative terms of trade, TC stands for relative trade costs, MD stands for relative macroeconomic developments and Res. stands for residuals. Values are in percentage of GDP representing averages during the corresponding time period.

Table 3 - Decomposition of Trade Deficits: Subsamples of Country Groups								
	TD	ToT	TC	MD	Res.			
Period: 1980-1994								
All Countries	1.479	-0.417	0.946	-0.581	1.532			
Non-OECD	2.718	0.416	1.253	-0.232	1.281			
OECD	-0.998	-2.084	0.333	-1.280	2.033			
East Asia & Pacific	0.712	-2.672	0.864	2.326	0.193			
Europe & Central Asia	-0.278	-1.001	0.502	-1.712	1.934			
Latin America & Caribbean	2.415	0.658	0.624	-1.731	2.865			
Middle East & North Africa	2.171	0.988	2.869	2.456	-4.142			
North America	0.408	2.546	-0.586	0.453	-2.005			
South Asia	2.484	-0.907	0.041	4.132	-0.782			
Sub-Saharan Africa	3.326	0.030	1.884	-1.850	3.262			
 Period: 1995-2015								
All Countries	5.240	-0.918	3.219	3.629	-0.690			
Non-OECD	8.267	-0.829	4.733	5.331	-0.968			
OECD	-0.926	-1.099	0.135	0.162	-0.124			
East Asia & Pacific	2.581	-2.836	2.457	4.748	-1.788			
Europe & Central Asia	1.247	-0.181	0.217	2.335	-1.125			
Latin America & Caribbean	6.195	-4.444	5.478	7.092	-1.931			
Middle East & North Africa	4.921	-0.998	4.964	4.875	-3.920			
North America	1.668	1.836	-0.798	3.735	-3.104			
South Asia	11.879	2.424	1.686	3.783	3.986			
Sub-Saharan Africa	10.077	1.094	6.188	1.268	1.526			

Notes: TD stands for trade deficit, ToT stands for relative terms of trade, TC stands for relative trade costs, MD stands for relative macroeconomic developments and Res. stands for residuals. Values are in percentage of GDP representing averages during the corresponding time period.



Figure 1 - Decomposition for the U.S. and Its Major Trade Partners



Figure 2 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit for Country Groups

Figure 3 - Trade Deficit versus Components: All Countries













Figure 5 - Trade Deficit versus Components: Non-OECD Countries







# Online Appendix for "Accounting for Trade Deficits"

This section depicts decompositions of trade deficits for individual countries. The figures show the patterns over time, whereas Table A.1 presents average decompositions (between 1980-2015) for individual countries.

# Figure A1 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #1





## Figure A2 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #2



# Figure A3 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #3

### Figure A4 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #4



# Figure A5 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #5



### Figure A6 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #6









## Figure A8 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #8



# Figure A9 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #9

### Figure A10 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #10





## Figure A11 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #11



## Figure A12 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #12



### Figure A13 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #13



### Figure A14 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #14



## Figure A15 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #15



## Figure A16 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #16



## Figure A17 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #17



## Figure A18 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #18



## Figure A19 - Decomposition of Trade Deficit #19



Table A.1 -	Mean	Decomposition	of	Trade	Deficit	for	All	Countries
-------------	------	---------------	----	-------	---------	-----	-----	-----------

Code	Country	Trade Deficit	Terms of Trade	Trade Costs	Macro Developments	Residuals
USA	United States	2.957	1.793	3.484	-1.646	-0.673
GBR	United Kingdom	2.786	7.649	1.443	-4.347	-1.960
AUT	Austria	0.348	-0.961	42.765	-21.794	-19.662
BEL	Belgium	-0.062	-5.901	15.603	-11.753	1.988
DNK	Denmark	-4.740	4.223	7.086	-14.285	-1.764
FRA	France	0.917	2.028	2.971	-4.538	0.456
DEU	Germany	-3.814	5.843	3.688	-8.225	-5.119
SMR	San Marino	9.791	-4.655	22.273	-5.307	-2.520
ITA	Italy	-0.348	1.420	-0.490	-2.830	1.551
LUX	Luxembourg	3.186	0.659	17.175	-14.322	-0.325
NLD	Netherlands	-5.576	-2.483	-13.943	7.437	3.412
NOR	Norway	-8.978	2.311	-16.805	1.622	3.893
SWE	Sweden	-3.496	4.699	-1.895	-7.834	1.534
CHE	Switzerland	1.202	6.023	-4.092	-8.161	7.432
CAN	Canada	-0.671	2.471	-4.904	6.381	-4.620
JPN	Japan	-1.725	6.005	-2.203	-5.447	-0.080
FIN	Finland	-2.910	-0.639	8.624	-9.991	-0.904
GRC	Greece	7.274	-3.578	11.345	-5.381	4.889
ISL	Iceland	2.304	-4.995	-14.133	17.462	3.970
IRL	Ireland	-18.181	-11.848	7.020	-10.800	-2.553
MLT	Malta	15.370	-26.220	-31.874	5.437	68.027
PRT	Portugal	6.729	-9.857	28.901	-5.008	-7.306
ESP	Spain	3.585	-2.839	6.242	-1.423	1.605
TUR	Turkey	5.767	-14.792	4.502	13.162	2.896
AUS	Australia	1.731	-0.355	12.516	1.359	-11.788
NZL	New Zealand	1.068	-1.119	-0.749	2.312	0.625
ZAF	South Africa	1.908	-1.696	3.469	3.351	-3.215
ARG	Argentina	-1.700	0.395	0.049	-2.281	0.138
BOL	Bolivia	-1.287	-1.445	-7.650	4.777	3.031
BRA	Brazil	-2.530	-6.237	0.563	0.844	2.299
CHL	Colombia	-3.170	-3.131	-11.779	-3.622	10.382
CDL	Contra Bina	1.347	-5.442	0.420	5.037	-12.975
DOM	Costa Alca	2.130	-5.242	1.250	0.405	18 252
FCU	Favadar	0.046	-4.205	-1.230	-0.024	18.352
SIV	El Salvador	17 204	-8.445	12 510	4.518	-0.040
GTM	Guatomala	8 204	4.062	6.080	8 400	-1.108
нті	Haiti	12 005	1 451	17 704	5 531	1.620
HND	Honduras	15 299	0.948	2 531	-8 470	20.290
MEX	Mexico	0.354	-10 174	6 505	9 115	-5.091
NIC	Nicaragua	29.158	8.768	18.926	14.617	-13.152
PAN	Panama	9.311	7.408	-6.856	-3.503	12.261
PRY	Paraguay	6.815	-4.316	7.441	12.538	-8.848
PER	Peru	4.369	-0.310	5.477	5.714	-6.513
URY	Uruguay	-0.832	-5.488	-4.159	2.413	6.403
VEN	Venezuela, Republica Bolivariana de	-5.749	17.400	-19.390	3.119	-6.878
ATG	Antigua and Barbuda	-16.570	0.997	-8.155	-17.410	7.998
BHS	Bahamas, The	107.813	-15.780	-59.710	-24.047	207.349
ABW	Aruba	12.851	-8.082	19.028	7.190	-5.286
BRB	Barbados	14.445	-5.805	27.618	-5.719	-1.649
BMU	Bermuda	18.620	-5.703	86.201	-52.408	-9.470
DMA	Dominica	22.387	15.161	52.255	18.732	-63.760
GRL	Greenland	2.432	100.985	-66.172	3.215	-35.596
GRD	Grenada	29.505	-13.666	25.760	10.483	6.928
GUY	Guyana	9.348	35.657	-7.368	-45.771	26.830
BLZ	Belize	11.404	-0.762	16.162	22.027	-26.023
JAM	Jamaica	18.846	3.249	32.135	-5.066	-11.472
KNA	Saint Kitts and Nevis	47.786	-8.765	62.778	-2.638	-3.589
LCA	Saint Lucia	29.342	0.593	-3.217	0.145	31.821
VCT	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	20.482	-21.639	57.599	-0.305	-15.172
SUR	Suriname	-0.191	63.747	8.258	-51.718	-20.478
TTO	Trinidad and Tobago	-3.394	-22.483	20.975	17.042	-18.927
BHR	Bahrain	14.800	29.168	-49.906	7.866	27.672
UYP	Cyprus	19.151	-11.581	23.134	-10.559	18.158
IKN	iran, isiamic Republic of	-5.605	0.871	-1.088	-0.958	1.570

Table A.1 -	Mean	Decomposition	of	Trade	Deficit	for	All	Countries
-------------	------	---------------	----	-------	---------	-----	-----	-----------

Code	Country	Trada Dofisit	Terms of Trade	Trada Costa	Magna Davalanmanta	Posiduala
	June		s ope	12 202	NIACIO Developments	22.142
INQ	Iraq	-20.711	0.920	12.202	-27.090	-22.143
ISA	Israel	0.595	-4.591	0.039	2.821	1.720
JUL	Jordan	18.734	-31.800	23.911	10.192	22 204
L DN	Kuwan	16.574	1 020	-30.292	1.051	-32.304
LBN	Lebanon	2.624	1.030	29.122	-4.309	-22.958
OMN	Oman	-13.775	5.690	-15.812	16.915	-20.568
QAI	Qatar	-14.354	-14.139	18.003	16.512	-34.730
SAU	Saudi Arabia	-6.185	-0.251	-21.544	-3.801	19.411
SYR	Syrian Arab Republic	-8.970	-36.059	16.008	-7.038	18.119
ARE	United Arab Emirates	1.633	-20.586	1.258	30.414	-9.454
EGY	Egypt	9.864	-3.060	14.767	10.660	-12.502
AFG	Afghanistan	16.634	4.700	12.045	-1.956	1.845
BGD	Bangladesh	4.347	0.408	-0.439	3.356	1.022
BTN	Bhutan	17.930	2.419	61.204	-33.873	-11.820
BRN	Brunei Darussalam	0.887	-116.200	-16.532	3.410	130.208
MMR	Myanmar	-1.559	-2.956	1.670	0.779	-1.052
KHM	Cambodia	3.139	-24.021	28.423	19.056	-20.319
LKA	Sri Lanka	5.223	2.608	-10.714	11.466	1.862
HKG	Hong Kong	6.072	40.683	-3.356	-3.079	-28.175
IND	India	3.138	-4.409	0.668	6.023	0.855
IDN	Indonesia	-1.919	-31.856	12.851	9.502	7.583
KOR	South Korea	-3.025	-9.606	-8.847	13.300	2.128
LAO	Lao People's Democratic Republic	14.597	2.090	8.632	-0.890	4.764
MAC	Macao	4.276	13.426	-38.492	36.186	-6.843
MYS	Malaysia	-4.484	-43.719	18.670	14.582	5.982
MDV	Maldives	45.002	9.876	-14.075	67.998	-18.797
NPL	Nepal	12.747	1.348	2.077	6.253	3.069
PAK	Pakistan	3.012	-3.866	3.316	0.772	2.790
PLW	Palau	20.028	-6.205	19.435	-15.821	22.620
PHL	Philippines	2.588	-0.305	-5.045	-0.087	8.025
SGP	Singapore	-4.345	-0.156	-39.217	3.563	31.465
THA	Thailand	0.764	-13.537	10.065	16.330	-12.095
VNM	Vietnam	6.440	-36.151	3.125	32.849	6.618
DJI	Diibouti	9.438	-2.436	30.906	-21.394	2.362
DZA	Algeria	-5.845	-16.045	2.411	11.944	-4.155
AGO	Angola	-34 794	22.038	-29 492	-11 653	-15 688
BWA	Botswana	8 003	-7.651	64 984	-9.972	-39.359
BDI	Burundi	10.226	2 568	9 539	-7 326	5 446
CMB	Cameroon	0.300	5 354	26 373	-1.320	28 003
CPV	Cabo Vordo	28 357	2 4 2 8	17 875	4.877	12 030
CAE	Control African Bopublic	3 508	0.625	0.001	-4.811	1 310
TCD	Chad	2.000	7 679	17 592	0.720	2.070
COM	Comoros	15 015	6 167	22 770	11 850	-2.070
COM	Comer Depublic of	17.001	12 002	22.119	-11.859	-1.172
DEN	Congo, Republic of	-17.901	-13.863	-8.209	0.995	5.199
BEN	Benin	0.495	-1.393	17.717	-4.735	-5.094
GNQ	Equatorial Guinea	-39.952	-38.694	-33.740	41.178	-8.689
ERI	Eritrea	10.150	2.727	16.982	-13.880	4.321
ETH	Ethiopia	12.463	4.832	1.105	7.134	-0.608
GAB	Gabon	-5.209	-9.461	-7.725	1.113	10.864
GMB	Gambia, The	13.578	14.037	11.269	-21.496	9.769
GHA	Ghana	11.374	0.762	-15.521	19.229	6.904
GNB	Guinea-Bissau	-0.145	7.687	0.917	-8.143	-0.606
GIN	Guinea	1.792	1.878	-2.407	1.523	0.797
CIV	Côte d'Ivoire	-8.839	-5.873	-6.702	-7.946	11.682
KEN	Kenya	6.957	1.402	21.949	-15.428	-0.965
LSO	Lesotho	25.748	-23.721	69.970	-43.567	23.066
LBR	Liberia	915.471	254.728	695.399	269.516	-304.171
LBY	Libya	12.648	44.347	2.917	10.952	-45.568
MDG	Madagascar	2.841	7.590	-3.918	2.577	-3.408
MWI	Malawi	3.822	18.566	-8.216	-14.052	7.523
MLI	Mali	9.987	-1.785	-7.205	2.713	16.263
MRT	Mauritania	5.953	-20.630	11.370	13.905	1.309
MUS	Mauritius	8.811	3.045	-6.228	13.980	-1.986
MAR	Morocco	8.245	-11.076	4.393	10.085	4.842
MOZ	Mozambique	8.927	-1.637	20.215	-25.910	16.257

Table A.1 -	Mean	Decomposition	of	Trade	Deficit	for	All	Countries
-------------	------	---------------	----	-------	---------	-----	-----	-----------

NRR         Nypr         7.97         -7.388         16.467         12.481         11.382           NGA         Nigeria         15.920         4.10         -3.066         -3.0511         3.368           SVE         Zinbalowe         2.862         60.853         -2.494         -42.823         -12.733           RWA         Rewanda         0.021         5.772         5.879         -5.875         5.746           SUE         Sac Tome and Principe         28.37         4.447         -2.1253         10.600         -7.015           SUE         Seengal         4.402         -15.163         10.010         7.186         0.533           SIE         Sizera Loone         13.014         3.655         14.243         -20.000         -2.756           SIDN         Sudam         4.463         -13.282         -5.513         -3.048           SWZ         Sweziland         11.345         46.856         -42.113         50.107         -4.260           TCO         Togo         -2.566         20.688         -3.455         -17.346         -1.468           GA         Uganda         1.089         -1.448         -2.287         -7.381         2.444           DFA	Code	Country	Trade Deficit	Terms of Trade	Trade Costs	Macro Developments	Residuals
NGA         Nigeria         -1-5.020         4.149         -3-066         -4-0.051         -4-0.051           CVVE         Zimshows         2.001         5.772         5.879         -4-3.052         -1-7.05           STP         Sao Tome and Principe         28.257         -1.726         -1.825         -1.825         -1.825         -1.825         -1.825         -1.826         -1.844         -2.355           Ster         Sterrat Leane         1.8.04         -3.051         -1.246         -1.606         -2.140         -2.4250           Stat         Sterrat Leane         1.8.04         -3.051         -1.244         -2.450         -2.450           Stat         Statan         -3.561         -1.244         -2.450         -2.450         -2.450           Stat         Statan         -3.561         -1.246         -2.450         -2.450         -2.450           Stat         Statan         -1.305         -1.233         -1.436         -1.796         -1.737           TON         Statan         -1.330         -1.418         -2.267         -1.381         -2.464           TON         Tousiai         -1.406         -2.060         -1.7981         -1.7981         -1.7981	NER	Niger	7.979	-7.388	16.467	-12.481	11.382
ZVEZunbabwe2.820.083-2.404-4.243-1.273SWARwanda0.015.775.80-5.701STCSao Tome and Principe28.35741.437-21.82510.650SYCSengal8.4021.12611.8441.344-2.335SEXSengal8.4021.12611.243-0.64330.235SUSSomalia2.55112.446-21.640-21.24024.220NAMNamibia4.463-1.3.282-5.123-1.343SUSSuralian1.7454.866-42.1416.0.07TXATananaia7.9751.310-7.476-1.733TATananaia7.9751.310-7.484-2.967TUNTunisia7.9751.310-1.4429.465-1.748GOTugo-2.86620.638-4.485-1.748-2.967TUNTunisia7.9751.310-1.742-7.444-2.945-7.381GAUganda11.089-1.442-9.465-1.173-7.81-9.178SUBSolmon Ialands0.9059.06847.706-2.981-1.9178SURZambia14.6652.064-2.277-1.813-9.178SURSamo1.739-1.4173-5.482-9.171-1.457SURSamo1.739-1.418-5.484-9.171-1.178TUNTunisia1.46652.0612-1.628-1.171 <t< td=""><td>NGA</td><td>Nigeria</td><td>-15.920</td><td>4.149</td><td>-3.096</td><td>-30.581</td><td>13.608</td></t<>	NGA	Nigeria	-15.920	4.149	-3.096	-30.581	13.608
IWA         Nearach         9.021         5.772         5.773         1.8.753         16.70           STP         Sac Tuess and Principe         22.827         11.726         14.854         13.484         -7.315           SYC         Seychelles         27.730         1.726         14.854         13.443         -6.033           SEE         Sterra Leone         13.614         3.656         14.244         -24.249         24.249           SVM         Sommaina         3.546         3.581         -3.225         5.133         -1.343           SWZ         Swainand         11.245         46.866         -42.131         50.017         -3.300           TUN         Swainand         11.245         46.866         -42.131         50.017         -3.300           TUN         Swainand         11.029         -3.433         1.748         -4.249         -4.442           TUN         Tumisia         7.395         1.313         1.748         14.847         -3.026           UGA         Uganda         11.089         -4.442         9.046         10.128         -7.404           ZMB         Zambia         -1.655         9.064         -2.74         -10.839         -7.117     <	ZWE	Zimbabwe	2.802	60.853	-2.494	-42.823	-12.733
STP         Sac Tome and Principe         22.267         14.467         -21.825         16.500         -7.515           SVC         Seynelan         27.03         1.7.64         -15.163         17.001         7.166         -23.53           SEN         Senegal         8.402         -15.163         17.001         7.166         -24.242           NAM         Sanania         2.561         124.46         -21.666         -12.424         24.229           NAM         Namihia         4.463         -13.32         -8.519         -20.20         -2.565           SUN         Swarland         11.245         446.856         -42.113         50.107         -43.666           TCO         Togo         -2.566         2.06.88         -4.348         -17.30         -1.734           TUN         Tunisia         7.308         -1.103         1.108         1.467         -3.026           GA         Uganda         11.089         -1.418         -2.287         -7.381         -2.040           TUN         Tunisia         1.662         2.044         -2.734         -1.030         -7.755           SIA         Samon         14.652         4.062         -2.673         -1.101	RWA	Rwanda	9.021	5.772	5.879	-8.375	5.746
SYC         Seychelias         27.730         1.726         1.4.8.54         13.8.44         -2.3.53           SEN         Simera Leanne         13.614         3.6.65         14.243         -2.6.040         21.766           SOM         Somalia         2.5.51         124.46         -21.666         -12.440         24.220           SDN         Stodan         3.5.46         -3.223         -5.123         -0.343           SWZ         Swailand         11.245         46.865         -12.440         -2.366           SWZ         Swailand         11.245         46.865         -3.223         5.123         -0.343           TGO         Orgo         -2.566         20.648         -3.455         -1.734         -2.660           GGA         Uganda         11.089         -1.412         9.945         10.126         -7.540           GTA         Uganda         11.689         2.064         -2.274         -10.839         7.075           SLB         Solonnon Islands         0.55         9.064         -7.740         -7.978         -19.798           FRO         Parene Islands         0.452         -2.0143         -3.529         25.663         -11.773           VIT	STP	Sao Tome and Principe	28.257	41.437	-21.825	16.560	-7.915
SEN         S. Senegal         8.402         -15.163         11.001         7.186         -0.503           SUE         Sierra Locone         13.61         3.605         14.243         -26.640         13.766           SOM         Somalia         2.551         11.246         -21.066         -12.449         24.220           NAM         Namibia         4.463         -13.382         -8.619         20.00         -2.766           SUZ         Swaziland         11.245         46.856         -42.113         50.107         -4.360           TZA         Touzania         7.975         1.310         7.738         14.9206         -7.540           TUN         Tunia         7.308         -1.412         -9.452         -7.381         2.944           BFA         Burkina Faze         6.620         -1.418         -2.257         7.381         2.944           ZIB         Zamiba         16.620         -1.418         -2.257         7.381         2.944           Silora         Janda         6.620         -1.418         -2.257         7.381         -9.65           Silora         Janda         6.450         -2.781         1.974         -4.523         1.171	SYC	Seychelles	27.730	1.726	14.854	13.484	-2.335
SLE         Sterna Leone         13.014         3.055         14.243         -20.000         27.766           SOM         Namibia         4.463         1.3.282         1.8.519         20.020         -2.756           SDN         Sudan         3.546         3.585         -3.225         5.123         -1.030           TXA         Tanzania         7.975         1.310         7.273         1.458         -2.060           TCO         Togo         -2.566         20.638         -3.485         -17.94         -17.33           TUN         Tunisia         7.308         -13.103         1.798         14.867         -3.026           GA         Uganda         11.089         -1.442         9.445         10.126         -7.544           GFG         Paramia         14.656         20.064         -2.287         7.381         2.944           ZIB         Schomna Ihands         9.555         9.668         44.776         -2.784         -7.051           FFO         Faroe Islands         6.462         -2.163         -3.529         -2.184         7.452           VUT         Vamata         22.540         -1.475         45.235         -0.1628         19.753	SEN	Senegal	8.492	-15.163	17.001	7.186	-0.533
SOM         Somalia         2.501         12.440         -2.166         -12.490         24.260           NAM         Nambin         3.463         -13.382         -8.519         20.00         -2.766           SDN         Sudan         3.546         -3.511         -3.225         5.123         -1.934           SWZ         Swaziland         111.245         48.856         -42.113         50.107         -4.360           TCA         Tanzania         7.975         1.130         7.733         1.458         -2.066           TUN         Tunisia         7.398         -1.418         -2.274         -7.341         -2.940           UGA         Uganda         11.089         -1.442         9.945         10.126         -7.540           JEN         Solomon Islands         9.555         9.668         47.706         -2.981         -1.978           SIB         Solomon Islands         9.555         9.668         47.706         -2.981         -1.978           VIT         Vanata         2.5240         -1.475         4.223         -4.1601         -2.883           VIT         Vanata         2.52540         -1.475         4.233         -4.1601         -3.235 <t< td=""><td>SLE</td><td>Sierra Leone</td><td>13.614</td><td>3.655</td><td>14.243</td><td>-26.040</td><td>21.756</td></t<>	SLE	Sierra Leone	13.614	3.655	14.243	-26.040	21.756
NAM         Namibia         4.463         -13.282         -8.70         9.000         -2.766           SDN         Suxdam         3.564         3.581         -3.325         5.123         -1.543           SWZ         Suvariland         11.245         46.856         -42.113         50.107         -43.60           TCO         Togo         -2.566         20.638         -3.435         -17.946         -1.737           TVN         Tunisia         7.398         -13.133         1.798         14.867         -3.262           UGA         Uguada         11.089         -1.42         0.905         -7.544           SLB         Solman Iands         9.59         9.0668         47.706         -27.981         -1.979           FRO         Faror Iands         6.462         -2.133         -5.432         -1.403         -7.54           SUM         Samoa         17.52         -1.475         4.533         -4.1601         2.038           FNG         Fapua New Guinea         1.300         -0.711         6.285         29.659         25.535           SWM         Samoa         17.52         -2.384         7.907         -6.284         1.818           TON	SOM	Somalia	2.551	12.446	-21.666	-12.449	24.220
SDN         Sudan         3.546         3.581         -3.225         5.123         -1.034           SWZ         Swaziland         11.245         46.856         -2.133         50.107         -4.309           TZA         Tararania         7.975         1.310         -7.273         1.458         -2.066           TUN         Turisia         7.38         -1.3193         1.798         14.867         -3.926           UGA         Uganda         11.089         -1.442         9.045         10.126         -7.540           SIB         Zambia         16.662         -1.418         -2.237         -7.381         2.944           ZMB         Zambia         16.662         -2.193         -35.292         -55.663         -11.717           FJI         Fiji         11.885         2.162         24.212         -21.894         -7.405           VUT         Vanustu         12.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.363           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.711         6.262         -90.512         -23.81           TON         Tonga         17.52         -2.381         7.355         -6.228         18.1383	NAM	Namibia	4.463	-13.282	-8.519	29.020	-2.756
SWZ         Swailand         11.245         46.856         -42.13         50.107         -43.60           TZA         Tanzania         7.975         1.310         7.273         1.458         -2.066           TGO         Togo         -2.566         20.638         -3.485         -17.946         -1.737           TWN         Tunisia         7.398         -13.193         1.708         41.4867         -3.926           UGA         Uganda         11.69         -1.442         9.945         10.126         -7.544           BLB         Solmon Islands         9.50         9.668         47.706         -27.981         -19.976           FRO         Face Islands         6.462         -2.193         -35.922         -56.663         -11.717           FJI         Fiji         11.855         2.162         24.212         -21.894         -7.405           KIR         Kiribati         12.5240         -1.477         4.523         -41.601         20.668           VT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.477         4.525         -00.712         -2.080           VSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.997         -6.228         18.138	SDN	Sudan	3.546	3.581	-3.225	5.123	-1.934
TZA       Tanzanin       7.075       1.100       7.773       1.468       -2.066         TGO       Togo       -2.566       20.638       -3.485       -1.7046       -1.773         TUN       Tuninia       7.398       -1.3193       1.798       14.667       3.926         UGA       Uganda       11.089       -1.442       9.045       10.125       -7.540         SIB       Solomon Islands       9.595       0.668       47.706       -2.287       7.381       2.944         ZMB       Zambia       14.656       20.064       -2.274       -10.839       7.705         SIB       Solomon Islands       9.595       0.668       47.706       -2.7981       -1.970         FRO       Farce Islands       6.642       -2.133       -35.202       25.666       11.111         FI       FUj       11.885       2.162       24.12       -21.844       7.405         VUT       Vannatu       22.540       -1.475       45.253       -41.601       2.0363         PNG       Papua New Guinea       1.390       -7.622       18.318       7.097       -6.225       19.610       45.253         VUT       Vannatu       27.53       <	SWZ	Swaziland	11.245	46.856	-42.113	50.107	-43.604
TCO         Topo         -2.566         20.638         -3.485         -17.446         -1.7373           TUN         Tunisia         7.398         -13.193         1.798         14.267         7.540           BFA         Burkina Faso         6.620         -1.418         -2.287         7.381         2.944           ZMB         Zambia         14.666         20.064         -2.274         -10.359         7.705           SLB         Solomon Islands         9.595         9.668         47.706         -27.981         -19.799           FRO         Faroe Islands         6.642         -2.193         -35.292         55.663         -11.71           FJI         FJji         11.885         2.162         24.212         -21.894         7.405           SIR         Kiribati         18.528         -6.079         11.334         -5.442         18.715           VUT         Vannatu         22.540         -4.475         45.253         -40.618         -29.659         25.555           Wir         Samoa         17.52         -2.384         7.097         -6.228         18.138           TON         Tonga         25.666         16.172         -1.031         16.617         -3	TZA	Tanzania	7.975	1.310	7.273	1.458	-2.066
TUN         Tuniaia         7.398         -13.103         1.798         14.867         3.926           UGA         Uganda         11.089         -1.414         9.945         10.126         -7.540           BFA         Burkina Faso         6.620         -1.418         -2.287         7.381         2.944           ZMB         Zambia         14.656         20.064         -2.274         -10.839         7.705           SLB         Solomon Islands         9.595         9.668         47.706         -27.981         -19.799           FRO         Farce Islands         6.620         -2.119         -35.202         5.666         -11.717           FII         FUj         11.852         2.162         24.212         -21.894         7.405           KIR         Kiribati         18.528         -0.670         11.373         -5.422         18.171         -3.166           VUT         Vanaut         22.540         -1.475         45.235         -90.12         -2.80.81           TON         Tonga         25.968         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           Mitronesia, Federated States of         1.172         1.621         1.6206         -5.365	TGO	Togo	-2.566	20.638	-3.485	-17.946	-1.773
UCA         Uganda         11.089         -1.422         9.945         10.126         -7.540           BFA         Burkina Faso         6.620         -1.418         -2.287         7.381         2.944           ZMB         Zambia         14.656         20.064         -2.287         -7.053         19.795           SLB         Solomon Islands         9.955         9.068         47.706         -27.981         19.795           FNO         Faroe Islands         6.462         2.193         -35.292         5.663         -11.717           FNI         Kiirbati         18.852         -6.079         11.334         -5.442         19.7405           VUT         Vanatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -29.659         25.535           VSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.907         -6.228         18.188           TON         Tonga         25.908         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           Mitcronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         10.606         -5.836         42.853           TUV         Tuvalu         77.355         47.825         62.728         18.10         3.721	TUN	Tunisia	7.398	-13.193	1.798	14.867	3.926
FFA         Burkina Faso         6.620         -1.418         -2.287         7.381         2.944           ZMB         Zambia         14.656         20.064         -2.274         -10.839         7.705           SLB         Solomon Islands         6.959         0.668         47.706         -2.7981         -19.798           FRO         Farce Islands         6.662         -2.103         -35.592         25.563         -11.711           FJI         Fiji         11.852         2.162         -24.212         -21.894         7.405           KIR         Kiribati         118.52         -6.079         11.334         -5.422         12.573           VUT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         29.653           VSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.907         -6.228         18.188           TON         Tonga         25.968         17.626         -5.629         16.817         -3.172           SMM         Micronesia, Federated States of         5.1702         -1.921         16.606         -5.86         42.853           TUV         Turah         7.325         -6.728         18.710         3.711         62	UGA	Uganda	11.089	-1.442	9.945	10.126	-7.540
ZMB         Zambia         14.656         20.064         -2.274         -10.839         7.705           SLB         Solomon Islands         9.595         9.668         47.706         -27.981         -19.799           FRO         Farce Islands         6.462         -2.193         -35.292         65.663         -11.171           FJI         Fiji         11.885         2.162         24.212         -21.804         7.405           KIR         Kiribati         18.528         -6.079         11.334         -5.442         18.715           VUT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.863           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.771         6.285         -29.659         25.535           WIT         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.006         -5.836         48.53           TUV         Tuvalu         77.355         7.825         62.728         18.70         3.740           AZE         Aserbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.300	BFA	Burkina Faso	6.620	-1.418	-2.287	7.381	2.944
SLB         Solomon Islands         9.055         9.668         47.706         -27.931         -19.795           FRO         Faroe Islands         6.462         -2.193         -35.292         55.663         -11.717           FI         Fij         11.885         2.162         24.212         -21.804         7.405           VUT         Vanuatu         12.520         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.363           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.771         6.285         -29.659         25.535           WSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.997         -6.228         18.183           TON         Tonga         25.9668         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         1.340           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -7.823         1.631         1.342           ALR         Balania         19.495         -1.203         2.301	ZMB	Zambia	14.656	20.064	-2.274	-10.839	7.705
FRO         Farce Islands         6.462         -2.103         -35.292         55.663         -11.717           FJI         Fiji         11.855         2.162         24.212         -21.894         7.405           KIR         Krirbati         11.852         -6.079         11.334         -5.442         18.715           VUT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.363           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.771         6.285         -29.059         25.535           VUT         Tonga         25.968         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -220.81           FM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.666         -5.836         42.853           TUV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.047         -1.1.660           ALB         Albania         19.405         -1.203         2.301         <	SLB	Solomon Islands	9.595	9.668	47.706	-27.981	-19.798
FJI         Fiji         11.885         2.162         24.212         -9.1894         7.465           KIR         Kiribati         18.528         -6.079         11.334         -5.442         18.715           VUT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.363           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.771         6.285         -29.659         25.535           WSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.997         -6.228         18.138           TON         Tonga         25.668         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         10.666         -5.836         42.853           TUV         Tuvalu         77.35         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.741           ARM         Armenia         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371 <td>FRO</td> <td>Faroe Islands</td> <td>6.462</td> <td>-2.193</td> <td>-35.292</td> <td>55.663</td> <td>-11.717</td>	FRO	Faroe Islands	6.462	-2.193	-35.292	55.663	-11.717
KIRKiribati $18.528$ $-6.079$ $11.334$ $-5.422$ $18.715$ VUTVanuatu $22.540$ $-1.475$ $45.253$ $-41.601$ $20.363$ PNGPapua New Guinea $1.300$ $-0.771$ $6.285$ $-20.659$ $25.535$ WSMSamoa $17.522$ $-2.384$ $7.997$ $-6.228$ $18.138$ TONTonga $25.968$ $17.356$ $-5.029$ $16.817$ $-3.176$ MHLMarshall Islands, Republic of $88.831$ $-36.6296$ $645.225$ $90.712$ $-2280.81$ FSMMicronesia, Federated States of $51.702$ $-1.921$ $16.606$ $-5.836$ $42.853$ TUVTuvalu $77.335$ $-7.825$ $62.728$ $18.710$ $3.721$ AZEAzzenbaijan $-2.818$ $7.335$ $-19.360$ $7.868$ $1.340$ BLRBelarus $8.230$ $31.862$ $-45.288$ $20.371$ $1.284$ ALBAlbania $19.495$ $-1.203$ $2.301$ $6.031$ $12.366$ GEOGeorgia $24.212$ $-2.478$ $15.244$ $25.688$ $-17.421$ KAZKazakhstan $-14.467$ $7.967$ $-35.565$ $11.440$ $10.601$ KGZKyrgyzstan $21.332$ $39.780$ $21.073$ $-24.818$ $-14.702$ BGRBulgaria $3.971$ $-6.818$ $18.018$ $8.64$ $-45.97$ TKKTurkmenistan $-10.980$ $28.803$ $6.185$ $-12.896$ $-33.072$ UKA<	FJI	Fiji	11.885	2.162	24.212	-21.894	7.405
VUT         Vanuatu         22.540         -1.475         45.253         -41.601         20.363           PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.390         -0.771         6.253         -29.659         25.535           WSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.997         -6.228         18.138           TON         Tonga         25.968         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         42.853           TVV         Tuvalu         77.335         7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.601           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         13.400           BLR         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.6	KIR	Kiribati	18.528	-6.079	11.334	-5.442	18.715
PNG         Papua New Guinea         1.300         -0.771         6.285         -29.659         25.535           WSM         Samoa         17.522         -2.384         7.997         -6.228         18.138           TON         Tonga         25.966         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         42.853           TVV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.688         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         21.312         27.363         35.424         25.62<	VUT	Vanuatu	22.540	-1.475	45.253	-41.601	20.363
WSMSamoa $17.522$ $-2.384$ $7.97$ $-6.228$ $18.138$ TONTonga $25.968$ $17.526$ $-5.029$ $16.817$ $-3.176$ MHLMarshall Islands, Republic of $88.81$ $-366.296$ $645.225$ $90.712$ $-280.81$ FSMMicronesia, Federated States of $51.702$ $-1.921$ $16.606$ $-5.836$ $42.853$ TUVTuvalu $77.335$ $-7.825$ $62.728$ $18.710$ $3.721$ ARMArmenia $23.478$ $1.449$ $11.044$ $22.947$ $-11.961$ AZEAzerbaijan $-2.818$ $7.335$ $-19.360$ $7.868$ $13.300$ BLRBelarus $8.230$ $31.862$ $-45.288$ $20.371$ $1.284$ ALEAlbania $19.495$ $-1.203$ $2.301$ $6.031$ $12.366$ GEOGeorgia $24.212$ $-2.478$ $15.424$ $28.688$ $-17.421$ KAZKazakhstan $-14.467$ $7.967$ $-35.565$ $11.440$ $1.601$ KGZKyrgyzstan $21.332$ $39.780$ $21.073$ $-24.818$ $-14.702$ BGRBulgaria $3.971$ $-6.818$ $18.018$ $-25.121$ $17.892$ MDAMoldova $22.738$ $33.412$ $-13.526$ $5.624$ $-32.562$ RUSRussian Federation $-11.811$ $-3.660$ $-3.238$ $5.684$ $-4.597$ TIKTajikistan $14.24$ $69.907$ $-53.879$ $17.531$ $-22.134$ CHN <td< td=""><td>PNG</td><td>Papua New Guinea</td><td>1.390</td><td>-0.771</td><td>6.285</td><td>-29.659</td><td>25.535</td></td<>	PNG	Papua New Guinea	1.390	-0.771	6.285	-29.659	25.535
TON         Tonga         25.968         17.356         -5.029         16.817         -3.176           MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         42.853           TVV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -10.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.658         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.691           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         23.371         -6.818         18.018         -25.	WSM	Samoa	17.522	-2.384	7.997	-6.228	18.138
MHL         Marshall Islands, Republic of         88.831         -366.296         645.225         90.712         -280.81           FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         42.853           TUV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.236           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.691           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.705           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.566	TON	Tonga	25.968	17.356	-5.029	16.817	-3.176
FSM         Micronesia, Federated States of         51.702         -1.921         16.606         -5.836         42.853           TUV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.691           KGZ         Kygyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.705           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -	MHL	Marshall Islands, Republic of	88.831	-366.296	645.225	90.712	-280.810
TUV         Tuvalu         77.335         -7.825         62.728         18.710         3.721           ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.40         1.691           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.702           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         3.3412         -13.536         35.424         -32.562           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.668         -4.557	FSM	Micronesia, Federated States of	51.702	-1.921	16.606	-5.836	42.853
ARM         Armenia         23.478         1.449         11.044         22.947         -11.961           AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.691           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.702           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -45.97           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557 <td>TUV</td> <td>Tuvalu</td> <td>77.335</td> <td>-7.825</td> <td>62.728</td> <td>18.710</td> <td>3.721</td>	TUV	Tuvalu	77.335	-7.825	62.728	18.710	3.721
AZE         Azerbaijan         -2.818         7.335         -19.360         7.868         1.340           BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         12.132         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.407           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.562           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         2.8803         6.185         -12.896         -33.0	ARM	Armenia	23.478	1.449	11.044	22.947	-11.961
BLR         Belarus         8.230         31.862         -45.288         20.371         1.284           ALB         Albania         19.495         -1.203         2.301         6.031         12.366           GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.6191           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.702           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.562           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -3	AZE	Azerbaijan	-2.818	7.335	-19.360	7.868	1.340
ALB       Albania       19.495       -1.203       2.301       6.031       12.366         GEO       Georgia       24.212       -2.478       15.424       28.688       -17.421         KAZ       Kazakhstan       -14.467       7.967       -35.565       11.440       1.691         KGZ       Kyrgyzstan       21.332       39.780       21.073       -24.818       -14.702         BGR       Bulgaria       3.971       -6.818       18.018       -25.121       17.892         MDA       Moldova       22.738       33.412       -13.536       35.424       -32.562         RUS       Russian Federation       -11.811       -3.660       -9.238       5.684       -4.597         TJK       Tajikistan       11.424       69.907       -53.879       17.531       -22.134         CHN       China       -2.124       -11.470       -2.450       7.240       4.557         TKM       Turkmenistan       -10.980       28.803       6.185       -12.896       -33.072         UKR       Ukraine       3.065       -15.412       -32.387       31.802       19.063         UZB       Uzbekistan       3.619       2.368       -0.551	BLR	Belarus	8.230	31.862	-45.288	20.371	1.284
GEO         Georgia         24.212         -2.478         15.424         28.688         -17.421           KAZ         Kazakhstan         -14.467         7.967         -35.565         11.440         1.691           KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.707           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.562           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.072           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832 <t< td=""><td>ALB</td><td>Albania</td><td>19.495</td><td>-1.203</td><td>2.301</td><td>6.031</td><td>12.366</td></t<>	ALB	Albania	19.495	-1.203	2.301	6.031	12.366
KAZ       Kazakhstan       -14.467       7.967       -35.565       11.440       1.691         KGZ       Kyrgyzstan       21.332       39.780       21.073       -24.818       -14.705         BGR       Bulgaria       3.971       -6.818       18.018       -25.121       17.892         MDA       Moldova       22.738       33.412       -13.536       35.424       -32.562         RUS       Russian Federation       -11.811       -3.660       -9.238       5.684       -4.597         TJK       Tajikistan       11.424       69.907       -53.879       17.531       -22.134         CHN       China       -2.124       -11.470       -2.450       7.240       4.557         TKM       Turkmenistan       -10.980       28.803       6.185       -12.896       -33.072         UKR       Ukraine       3.065       -15.412       -32.387       31.802       19.063         UZB       Uzbekistan       3.619       2.368       -0.551       4.832       -3.030         CUB       Cuba       4.257       4.647       8.974       -4.317       -5.048         CZE       Czechia       -1.293       -4.944       -7.990	GEO	Georgia	24.212	-2.478	15.424	28.688	-17.421
KGZ         Kyrgyzstan         21.332         39.780         21.073         -24.818         -14.705           BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.565           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.072           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479<	KAZ	Kazakhstan	-14.467	7.967	-35.565	11.440	1.691
BGR         Bulgaria         3.971         -6.818         18.018         -25.121         17.892           MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.567           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.072           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479	KGZ	Kyrgyzstan	21.332	39.780	21.073	-24.818	-14.702
MDA         Moldova         22.738         33.412         -13.536         35.424         -32.562           RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.597           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.072           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909	BGR	Bulgaria	3.971	-6.818	18.018	-25.121	17.892
RUS         Russian Federation         -11.811         -3.660         -9.238         5.684         -4.997           TJK         Tajikistan         11.424         69.907         -53.879         17.531         -22.134           CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.450         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.072           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135     <	MDA	Moldova	22.738	33.412	-13.536	35.424	-32.562
TJK       Tajikistan       11.424       69.907       -53.879       17.531       -22.134         CHN       China       -2.124       -11.470       -2.450       7.240       4.557         TKM       Turkmenistan       -10.980       28.803       6.185       -12.896       -33.072         UKR       Ukraine       3.065       -15.412       -32.387       31.802       19.063         UZB       Uzbekistan       3.619       2.368       -0.551       4.832       -3.030         CUB       Cuba       4.257       4.647       8.974       -4.317       -5.048         CZE       Czechia       -1.293       -4.944       -7.990       10.543       1.098         SVK       Slovakia       -0.102       -5.556       4.062       -16.087       17.479         EST       Estonia       8.872       -41.698       26.331       6.330       17.909         LVA       Latvia       15.419       -17.897       29.443       13.008       -9.135         HUN       Hungary       -0.573       -1.210       18.063       -26.043       8.617	RUS	Russian Federation	-11.811	-3.660	-9.238	5.684	-4.597
CHN         China         -2.124         -11.470         -2.430         7.240         4.557           TKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896         -33.071           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	TJK	Tajikistan	11.424	69.907	-53.879	17.531	-22.134
IKM         Turkmenistan         -10.980         28.803         6.185         -12.896        33.07           UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	CHN	China	-2.124	-11.470	-2.450	7.240	4.557
UKR         Ukraine         3.065         -15.412         -32.387         31.802         19.063           UZB         Uzbekistan         3.619         2.368         -0.551         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	IKM	1 urkmenistan	-10.980	28.803	0.185	-12.896	-33.072
UZB         UZDEKISTAN         3.019         2.308         -0.531         4.832         -3.030           CUB         Cuba         4.257         4.647         8.974         -4.317         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	UKK		3.065	-15.412	-32.387	31.802	19.063
CUBB         CUBA         4.237         4.647         8.974         -4.617         -5.048           CZE         Czechia         -1.293         -4.944         -7.990         10.543         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	OTR	Uzbekistan	3.619	2.308	-0.551	4.832	-3.030
CZE         Czechia         -1.295         -4.394         -1.990         10.445         1.098           SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         17.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617           LTU         Lithurnia         12.126         14.098         21.495         46.955         10.944	COB	Cuba	4.207	4.047	8.974	-4.317	-5.048
SVK         Slovakia         -0.102         -5.556         4.062         -16.087         11.479           EST         Estonia         8.872         -41.698         26.331         6.330         17.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617	CZE	Czecnia	-1.293	-4.944	-7.990	10.543	1.098
EST         Estonia         5.672         -41.096         20.351         0.350         11.909           LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.897         29.443         13.008         -9.135           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617           LTU         Lithuania         12.126         14.092         21.495         46.955         10.944	DOL	Feterie	-0.102	-0.000	4.002	-10.087	17.479
LVA         Latvia         15.419         -17.597         29.443         15.008         -9.159           HUN         Hungary         -0.573         -1.210         18.063         -26.043         8.617           LTIL         Lithuania         12.196         14.092         21.495         46.995         10.994	LUA	Listonia	15 410	-41.098	20.331	12.009	0.125
HOW         Hungary         -0.515         -1.210         16.003         -20.043         6.017           LTH         Lithuania         19.196         14.000         91.405         46.005         10.001	LVA	Latvia	0.572	-17.097	29.443	26.042	-9.155
1/1/1/A 3// // XU2	ITU	Lithuania	-0.373	-1.210	21 495	-20.045	10 804
Dio         Instrumenta         12.160         -14.000         -01.460         40.000         10.594           MNC         Monoplia         7.927         5.595         14.610         12.610         2.661	MNC	Mongolia	7 997	-14.088	-31.485	40.805	2 661
NING NUNGUNA (1.201 0.000 -14.019 12.010 3.001 PRK North Korea 0.177 0.829 0.355 0.471 0.779	PBK	North Korea	0.177	0.000	-14.019	0.471	-0.779
HRV Crostia 10.251 0.22 -0.300 0.4/1 -0.//2	HRV	Croatia	10.251	0.002	-0.000	0.4/1	10.112
MAX         Orostia         10.301         0.201         51.4601         -0.304         -12.377           SVN         Slovenia         -1.443         16.162         21.700         12.414         2.656	SVN	Slovenia	10.001	-16 162	31.401	-0.904	-12.311
MKD Macadonia FVR 17.668 12.902 17.161 99.905 6.660	MKD	Macedonia FVR	-1.440	13 202	-17 161	-10.414	-5.050
Mile         Macedonia, Fift         17.000         10.203         -17.101         20.293         -0.009           BIH         Bosnia and Herzegovina         28.857         -13.803         16.586         56.081         30.007	BIH	Bosnia and Herzegovina	28.857	-13 803	16 586	26.295	-30.009
POL Poland 1.464 -3.316 5.594 -2.679 1.865	POL	Poland	1 464	-3,316	5.594	-2.679	1.865

Notes: Values are in % of GDP representing averages between 1980-2015.